Rubrics as Road Maps to Information Literacy Instruction: Creating and Using Rubrics in Academic Libraries

Sarah Dahlen
California State University, Monterey Bay
Today’s Agenda

- Why rubrics?
- Steps for creating a rubric
- Hands-on learning
  - Create a rubric development plan
  - Make a rubric
Audience Poll

- Where are you from?
- How familiar are you with rubrics?
- What is your interest in rubrics?
Why rubrics?

- Rubric: a tool designed to measure whether student work meets a set of predetermined standards
# Information Literacy Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Level 5</th>
<th>Level 4</th>
<th>Level 3</th>
<th>Level 2</th>
<th>Level 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Design research objective</td>
<td>Designs original, concise and focused research objective appropriate to assignment</td>
<td>Designs concise, focused research objective appropriate to assignment</td>
<td>Designs research objective appropriate to assignment</td>
<td>Designs research objective that requires more specific focus.</td>
<td>Fails to develop research objective.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access information</td>
<td>Locates reliable, discipline specific information from a variety of sources.</td>
<td>Locates quality information on a topic from a variety of sources.</td>
<td>Locates needed information on a topic from a variety of sources.</td>
<td>Minimally successful at locating needed information.</td>
<td>Unsuccessful at locating information on the topic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate information and sources critically</td>
<td>Analyzes quality, discipline-specific information from various sources to assess accuracy, authority and timeliness</td>
<td>Analyzes quality information from various sources to assess accuracy, authority and timeliness</td>
<td>Analyzes information from various sources to assess accuracy, authority and timeliness</td>
<td>Shows minimal evaluation of sources.</td>
<td>Shows no evidence of source evaluation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identify and integrate primary sources</td>
<td>Relates primary source material to historical context and articulates an in-depth analysis of its relevance to topic</td>
<td>Includes primary source material with clear reference to historical context and relevance to topic</td>
<td>Includes primary source material with adequate reference to historical context and relevance to topic</td>
<td>Includes some primary source material with little or no historical context</td>
<td>Does not include primary source material</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a research plan</td>
<td>Develops a high quality research plan that integrates scholarly discipline specific resources.</td>
<td>Develops a quality research plan that integrates scholarly, discipline specific resources.</td>
<td>Develops a research plan that integrates scholarly, discipline specific resources.</td>
<td>Minimally successful at developing a research plan.</td>
<td>Unable to develop a research plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrate information to accomplish the planned objective</td>
<td>Successfully integrates compiled information, demonstrating a sophisticated use of citation, into a high quality, original product to effectively accomplish the planned objective.</td>
<td>Successfully integrates compiled information with citations in appropriate format to effectively accomplish the planned objective.</td>
<td>Successfully integrates compiled information, with citations generally in appropriate format, to accomplish the planned objective.</td>
<td>Minimally successful at integrating compiled information, frequently citing information inaccurately and/or inaccurately.</td>
<td>Unable to integrate information and use citations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use information ethically and legally</td>
<td>Follows laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and demonstrates an understanding of plagiarism</td>
<td>Follows laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and demonstrates an understanding of plagiarism</td>
<td>Follows laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and demonstrates an understanding of plagiarism</td>
<td>Lacks adequate knowledge of laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and/or use of information resources and commits unintentional plagiarism</td>
<td>Lacks knowledge of laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and shows evidence of willful plagiarism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>Level 5</td>
<td>Level 4</td>
<td>Level 3</td>
<td>Level 2</td>
<td>Level 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design research objective</td>
<td>Designs original, concise and focused research objective appropriate to assignment</td>
<td>Designs concise, focused research objective appropriate to assignment</td>
<td>Designs research objective appropriate to assignment</td>
<td>Designs research objective that requires more specific focus.</td>
<td>Fails to develop research objective.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access information</td>
<td>Locates reliable, discipline specific information from a variety of sources</td>
<td>Locates quality information on a topic</td>
<td>Locates needed information on a topic from a variety of sources</td>
<td>Minimally successful at locating needed information.</td>
<td>Unsuccessful at locating information on the topic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate information and sources critically</td>
<td>Analyzes quality, discipline-specific information from various sources to assess accuracy, authority and timeliness</td>
<td>Analyzes quality information from various sources to assess accuracy, authority and timeliness</td>
<td>Analyzes information from various sources to assess accuracy, authority and timeliness</td>
<td>Shows minimal evaluation of sources.</td>
<td>Shows no evidence of source evaluation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identify and integrate primary sources</td>
<td>Relates primary source material to historical context and articulates an in-depth analysis of its relevance to topic</td>
<td>Includes primary source material with clear reference to historical context and relevance to topic</td>
<td>Includes primary source material with adequate reference to historical context and relevance to topic</td>
<td>Includes some primary source material with little or no historical context</td>
<td>Does not include primary source material.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a research plan</td>
<td>Develops a high quality research plan that integrates scholarly discipline specific resources</td>
<td>Develops a quality research plan that integrates scholarly, discipline specific resources</td>
<td>Develops a research plan that integrates scholarly, discipline specific resources</td>
<td>Minimally successful at developing a research plan.</td>
<td>Unable to develop a research plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrate information to accomplish the planned objective.</td>
<td>Successfully integrates compiled information, demonstrating a sophisticated use of citation, into a high quality, original product to effectively accomplish the planned objective.</td>
<td>Successfully integrates compiled information with citations in appropriate format to effectively accomplish the planned objective.</td>
<td>Successfully integrates compiled information, with citations generally in appropriate format, to accomplish the planned objective.</td>
<td>Minimally successful at integrating compiled information, frequently citing information inaccurately and/or inappropriately.</td>
<td>Unable to integrate information and use citations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use information ethically and legally</td>
<td>Follows laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and demonstrates an understanding of plagiarism</td>
<td>Follows laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and demonstrates an understanding of plagiarism</td>
<td>Follows laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and demonstrates an understanding of plagiarism</td>
<td>Lacks adequate knowledge of laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and/or use of information resources and commits unintentional plagiarism.</td>
<td>Lacks knowledge of laws, regulations, and institutional policies regarding access to and use of information resources and shows evidence of willful plagiarism.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Levels of evaluation

1. Reaction
2. Learning
3. Behavior
4. Results

Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick, 2006
Objectives of rubric use

- Provide clear expectations
- Evaluate student work
- Assess effectiveness of instruction
- Accreditation, conform to national standards
- Demonstrate value of library instruction
Advantages of Rubrics

- Valid assessment instrument *(see Samson, 2010)*
- Adaptable from a set of standards *(Knight, 2006)*
- Tied to outcomes; adaptable to different assignments *(Knight, 2006)*
- Clarity of expectations for students and faculty *(Knight, 2006)*
- Opportunity for librarians and stakeholders to agree on outcomes *(Oakleaf, 2007)*
- Reduce scoring subjectivity *(Oakleaf, 2007)*
Disadvantages of Rubrics

- Time consuming to create (Knight, 2006)
- May be dependent on assignment (Knight, 2006)
- May not be well-suited to measure process-based skills (Knight, 2006)
- Scoring discrepancies (Oakleaf, 2007)
Steps to Rubric Use

1. Create rubric
2. Test rubric
3. Train users
4. Employ rubric
5. Incorporate feedback
1. Create Rubric

- Identify stakeholders and work group(s)
- Objectives
- Outcomes
- Levels of achievement
- Standard
2. Test Rubric

- Audience appropriate
- Ease of use
- Validity
- Inter-rater reliability
3. Train Users

- Basics, justification
- Practice together
- Logistics
  - Assignments
  - Communication of results
4. Employ Rubric

- Share rubric with students
- Apply rubric
- Share results with students
5. Incorporate Feedback

- Debrief with instructors
- Revise
  - Rubric
  - Assignment
  - Instruction
Hands-on Practice

- Rubric development plan
- Create rubric
Questions?

🌟 sdahlen@csumb.edu